OFFICE OF AUDITOR GENERAL

Substitute Management Division
Audit Report

2019

Substitute Management Division Audit
Executive Summary

OBJECTIVE

To evaluate the District's Substitute Management function to ensure proper oversight and monitoring for the Per Diem Teachers and Administrators.

BACKGROUND

Human Resources manages the Substitute Management Division to support schools in utilizing Per Diem Substitutes to provide daily coverage for teacher and administrator absences. SmartFind is the system utilized to facilitate recording teacher and administrator absences and fulfilling those absences with a substitute. The District employs approximately 1,500 Per Diem Substitutes. On an annual basis, over 100,000 SmartFind jobs are filled each year.

SCOPE

We obtained an understanding of the District's processes and protocols for the Substitute Management Division. We evaluated the budgeting and budget monitoring process to assess effectiveness. The reasons for requiring substitutes were evaluated to determine areas of focus within the District to help reduce the need for substitutes. We obtained an understanding of the SmartFind Express system and compared to Payroll absences to ensure alignment. We evaluated the overall adequacy of the monitoring activities of the Substitute Management Division. The period under review included 2017-18 and 2018-19.

CONCLUSION

Human Resources must ensure there are adequate resources with the proper certifications to fulfill the substitute demand throughout the District and properly budget for Per Diem needs. Significant difficulty occurs in meeting the daily demand for substitutes across school buildings. Due to shortages, the District must decrease the demand for substitutes through a reduction in teacher absenteeism and/or an increase recruitment efforts to fill vacancies. Comprehensive written protocols and procedures should exist for all pertinent areas of the Substitute Management Division. Improved monitoring and oversight should also be performed to ensure compliance with sound business practices. SmartFind and PeopleSoft Time and Labor should be adequately monitored to ensure the systems properly align, jobs are accurately reported, absences are recorded in PeopleSoft, and payments made to Per Diem Substitutes are proper. Operating practices and labor agreements should be modified to decrease the heavy reliance on substitute labor and any potential impact of substitute labor on student achievement.

Substitute Management Division Audit
Summary of Recommendations

Rec #	Recommendation
1	*Develop and implement comprehensive written protocols and procedures for the Substitute Management Division, including, procedures for obtaining Per Diem Substitutes, non-instructional per diem labor, SmartFind System, data entry and monitoring PeopleSoft Time and Labor, school-based monitoring and departmental monitoring and reporting. Communicate and enforce compliance with the protocols and procedures.*
2	*Prepare the budget for the Substitute Management Division utilizing a methodical basis and retain supporting documentation. Monitor and effectively manage actual expenditures to avoid overspending.*
3	*Increase recruitment efforts to hire permanent teachers to fill the vacant positions.*
4	*Develop a plan to minimize teacher absenteeism. Communicate with the Rochester Teachers Association regarding the plan to reduce teacher absences.*
5	*Develop a process to ensure all jobs are properly reported in SmartFind. Perform effective monitoring to ensure all data recorded in SmartFind is complete and accurate and properly reflects all absences and job fulfillments. Establish reporting and escalate communication holding individuals accountable for not complying with existing procedures.*
6	*Reconcile teacher absences reported in SmartFind to PeopleSoft to ensure all absences taken are reported for payroll processing. Establish effective reporting and remediation procedures to School Chiefs and Building Principals to increase accountability for accurately recording absences and teacher reducing leave accruals.*
7	*Review and Distribute the exception report weekly for Substitutes Obtained Outside of SmartFind. Develop a process which requires School Chiefs and schools to review the report and make timely corrections. Monitor and reporting to ensure corrections are made timely and that the frequency of exceptions are decreasing.*
8	*Ensure Per Diem Substitute time is reported properly in PeopleSoft Time and Labor. Review Per Diem Substitute time in PeopleSoft thoroughly and include a validation of the teacher the substitute worked for to ensure alignment with SmartFind. Ensure only one substitute is reporting time for the teacher absence.*

Rec #	Recommendation
9	*Ensure compliance with NYSED regulations regarding certification requirements for substitute teaching. At a minimum, maintain regular monitoring and reporting to identify uncertified substitutes in critical positions and ensure intensive supervision occurs to increase student outcomes.*